ATTACHMENT C

NIH/NIDCR CONSENSUS DEVELOPMENT CONFERENCE (CDC) ON CARIES

SUBSECTION ON SALIVA AS A RISK FACTOR IN CARIES

EVIDENCE TABLE 1B.

			CARIES STATUS	SASSESSMENTS	SALI	VA STATUS ASSESSMENTS	
AUTHOR	Y E A R	Tooth/ Dentition Type	Scoring Method Detection Method	Caries Location Caries Extent Caries Process Described	Risk Indicators Risk Definition Clinical Decision Making	Source of Saliva	Chief Salivary Physiology Described
Almståhl et al.	1999	Permanent	MFS Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Filled lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Buffer capacity; pH
Bergman and Ericson	1986	Permanent	DFS Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	Salivary test (buffer capacity) Flow rate < 0.75 ml/min; Buffer capacity final pH <5.3 ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity; pH
Bhatia et al.	1986	Mixed; Permanent	DMFT Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of total IgA

Camling and Köhler	1987	Primary	dfs	ND/NA	Clinical judgement based on dental	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of total IgA and anti-S. mutans IgA, and
			Review of clinic records	ND/NA	evaluation	saliva	anti-S. sanguis IgA; Binding activity of IgA to various S. mutans and S. sanguis
				Cavitated lesion	Caries experience negative, dfs=0; Caries experience positive, dfs>2		serotypes
					ND/NA		
Chia et al.	1997	Permanent	DMFS Clinical examination	ND/NA	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation; Salivary test	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of total and anti-S. mutans IgA; Binding activity of IgA to various natural and
				Cavitated lesion	(microbial counts)		synthetic S. mutans glucosyltransferase protein/peptides
					Caries-free (CF), DMFS=0, low salivary microbial counts: Caries-		
					active (CA), DMFS>1, high salivary microbial		
					counts ND/NA		
Collin et al.	1998	Permanent	DMFT; DS; DS (root); FS; FS (root); WHO criteria (1987);	Crown; root	Salivary test (flow rate)	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
			Root caries criteria (DePaola et al. 1989); Data expressed	ND/NA	Stimulated whole saliva < 0.8 ml /min	saliva	
			as percent surfaces at risk	Cavitated lesion; Root demineralization	ND/NA		
			Clinical examination; Panoramic radiograph	demineralization			
Coogan and Motlekar	1996	Permanent	DMFT; WHO criteria (1987)	ND/NA	Salivary and plaque test	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Levels of organic acids
			Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs	ND/NA	Flow rate and amount of acids present in saliva	saliva (collected after glucose	
				Cavitated lesion	and plaque	rinse)	
					ND/NA		

Dahllöf et al.	1989	Primary	dfs; dfs (proximal); ds; ds (proximal); ci (proximal; incipient); Koch Criteria (1967) Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs	Crown Caries defined as penetrating into dentin; initial caries lesions (ci) defined as confined to enamel Cavitated lesion; Enamel demineralization	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
Dahllöf et al.	1997	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DFS; Proximal caries measured by bite-wing radiographs Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs	ND/NA Proximal caries was recorded when radiolucency penetrated into dentin; Initial caries was defined as a radiolucency limited to enamel Cavitated lesion; Demineralization	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
Demers et al.	1992	Primary; Primary; Mixed; Permanent	dmfs, WHO criteria (1979) Clinical examination DMFT; dmft; WHO criteria (1977) Clinical examination	ND/NA RD/NA Cavitated lesion ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Stimulated whole saliva (authors did not specify mode of stimulation) Masticatory-stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Buffer capacity General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of total IgA and IgG
Dens et al.	1996	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFT; dmft; WHO criteria (1977) Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	Salivary test (buffer capacity) ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Buffer capacity

Dodds et al. Drake et al.	1997	Permanent Permanent	DMFS; NIDCR criteria (1987) Clinical examination DFS; Radike criteria (1968)	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA Crown	Clinical judgment based on dental evaluation DMFS>5, caries-active (CA); DMFS=0, caries-free (CF) ND/NA ND/NA	Gustatory- stimulated parotid saliva	General protective; Flow rate; pH; buffer capacity; Levels of Na, K, Cl, Ca, total protein, histatins, acidic PRPs, "fast" basic PRPs, basic PRPs, statherin, amylase, uric acid Self-reported dry mouth
			Clinical examination in the subject's home	ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA		
Duggal et al.	1991	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFT; deft; WHO criteria (1977) Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation DMFT/deft values of 3 groups: Low caries 0-2, Moderate caries 3-4, High caries ≥5	Unstimulated whole saliva	Concentrations of Zn, Cu, Fe, Mn, F
Faine et al.	1992	Permanent	DFS (root); Root caries index (RCS) according to criteria of Katz (1980) and Banting et al. (1980) Clinical examination	Root Cementum and dentin Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
Fiehn et al.	1986	Permanent	DMFS Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; α-amylase activity; Sucrase activity
Franco et al.	1996	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFT; DMFS; dmft; dmfs; WHO criteria (1987) Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; Antimicrobial; Level of total salivary IgA

Fure	1998	Permanent	DFS (crown); DFS (root); DMFS (root); Incidence over 5 years expressed as a percent of surfaces at risk; Coronal caries (enamel caries) recorded according to WHO criteria (1987); Root surface caries recorded according to Banting et al. criteria (1980)	Crown, root ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Masticatory stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate, buffer capacity, pH
Furhoff et al.	1998	Permanent	DMFS; DS; WHO criteria (1987) Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate
Gavaldá et al	1999	Permanent	Carious, absent, and obturated teeth (CAO) index, WHO criteria (1987) Clinical examinations	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Gustatory- stimulated whole saliva; Gustatory- stimulated parotid saliva	General protective; Flow rate
Gregory et al.	1986	Permanent	DMFS Clinical examination; Radiographs	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated parotid saliva	General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of anti-S. mutans IgA
Gregory et al.	1990	Permanent	DMFS Clinical examination, using transillumination	Crown ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Unstimulated parotid saliva	General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of total and anti-S. mutans IgA, IgA1 and IgA2; Secretory component and J chain; Lactoferrin and Iysozyme activity; Agglutination activity
Gregory et al.	1991	Permanent	DMFS; DS clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Unstimulated parotid saliva	Antimicrobial; Agglutination; Levels of IgA, IgM and IgG, total protein

Gregory et al	1995	Permanent	DMFS	ND/NA	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva;	General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of anti-S. mutans IgA	
			Clinical examination	ND/NA	ND/NA	Unstimulated parotid saliva		
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA	parotid sanva		
Grindefjord et al.	1995	Primary	dfs; ds	Crown	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; Buffer capacity	
O. U			Clinical examination	ND/NA	ND/NA			
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA			
Guivante- Nabet et al.	1999	Permanent	Caries activity index (CAR; Fejerskov et al., 1991),	Crown, root	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity	
Nabel et al.			including sound, inactive, active, destroyed and filled	ND/NA	ND/NA	saliva	Bullet capacity	
			surfaces; Root caries index (Katz et al., 1982)	Cavitated lesion	ND/NA			
			Clinical examination					
Hallett et al.	1995	Primary; Mixed;	DMFT; dmft; partial DMFS for mandibular anterior teeth;	ND/NA	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; Buffer capacity	
		Permanent	WHO criteria (1987)	ND/NA	ND/NA			
			Clinical Examination	Cavitated lesion	ND/NA			
Hellyer et al.	1989	Permanent	ND/NA	Root	ND/NA	ND/NA	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity	
ui.			ND/NA	ND/NA	ND/NA		Capacity	
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA			
Hocini et al.	1993	Permanent	DMFT	ND/NA	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole Saliva	General protective; Antimicrobial; Flow rate; Lactoferrin concentration; Levels of	
			ND/NA	ND/NA	ND/NA	Whole dailyd	total IgA and IgA2, and anti-S. sobrinus	
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA		IgA and anti-S. sanguis IgA; Binding avidity of IgA	
Holbrook	1993	Primary; Mixed	DMFS; DMFT; dmfs; dmft; Holbrook et al. criteria (1989)	ND/NA	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity; pH; Secretory status	
		WINGU		ND/NA	ND/NA	saliva	capacity, pri, decretory status	
			Clinical examination	Cavitated lesion	ND/NA			

Holbrook et al.	1993	Primary; Mixed	DMFS; DMFT; dmfs; dmft; Holbrook et al. criteria (1989) Clinical examinations	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation; Salivary tests (flow rate, buffer capacity, microbial counts) Baseline caries score ≥4 dmfs, ≥3 new carious lesions; S. mutans count ≥10 ⁵ cfu/ml, lactobacilli count ≥10 ⁴ cfu/ml, pH <7, stimulated flow rate < 1 ml/min, buffer capacity < pH 5.5 ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity; pH; Secretory status
Johansson et al.	1992	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFS; dmfs Clinical examination, Bite-wing radiographs	Clinical cavity or explorer stick; Radiographic lesion exceeding two thirds of the enamel Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Masticatory- stimulate whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity; pH
Kirstilä et al.	1994	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFT; DMFS; dmft; dmfs; WHO criteria (1977) Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs	ND/NA DS was recorded if the lesion was detectably softened; Approximal enamel lesions which were visible only radiographically were included Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective: Antimicrobial; Flow rate; Buffer capacity; Levels of lysozyme, lactoferrin, total peroxidase activity, myeloperoxidase, hypothiocyanite, thiocyanate, agglutination rate, and total and specific anti- S. mutans IgA, IgG and IgM

Kirstilä et al.	Mixed;	Mixed; ds; WHO criteria (1987); Permanent (fissure sealants and third	ND/NA DS was	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Antimicrobial; Flow rate; Buffer capacity; Levels of lysozyme, lactoferrin, total peroxidase activity,	
		Permanent	molars were not included in	recorded if the	ND/NA	Saliva	hypothiocyanite, thiocyanate, agglutination
			the DMFS index); White spots were recorded as clinically active initial caries lesions in enamel and expressed as C ₁ S	lesion was detectably softened	ND/NA		rate, and total and specific anti- S. mutans IgA and IgG
				Cavitated lesion			
			Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs				
Laurikainen and	1998	Permanent	DMFT; WHO criteria (1987)	ND/NA	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate: pH
Kuusisto			Clinical examination	ND/NA	ND/NA	saliva	Tiow rate, pri
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA		
Lenander- Lumikari et	1998	Permanent	DMFT; WHO criteria (1987)	ND/NA	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Levels of total protein, lactoferrin, myeloperoxidase, salivary
al.			Clinical examination	ND/NA	ND/NA	saliva	peroxidase, lysozyme, thiocyanate, calcium, sodium and potassium
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA		·
Lowe et al.	1997	Mixed; Permanent	DMFT; WHO criteria (1987)	ND/NA	Clinical judgement based on dental	Unstimulated whole saliva; two	General protective; Oral glucose clearance rate
			Clinical examination	ND/NA	evaluation	series of timed collections 2	
				Cavitated lesion	Caries-free (DMFT=0); Caries-prone (DMFT <u>></u> 3)	weeks apart; saliva collected	
					ND/NA	before and up to 9 min. after	
					ND/NA	glucose rinse	
Lundgren et al.	1997	Permanent	DMFS; DFS; Root caries index (RCI; Katz criteria, 1984)	Crown; Root	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity; Oral glucose clearance rate
			Clinical examination	ND/NA	ND/NA	saliva	supervisity, or the grant of the supervisity of the
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA		
MacEntee et al.	1993	Permanent	DFS; DS; FS	Crown; Root	ND/NA	Stimulated whole saliva (as per	General protective; Flow rate
ot al.			Clinical examination	ND/NA	ND/NA	Mandel and Wotman,1976)	
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA	, , , , , , , ,	

Meurman et al.	1997	Permanent	DMF	ND/NA	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
			Clinical examination	ND/NA	ND/NA	saliva	
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA	-	
Milosevic and Slade	1989	Permanent	DMFS	ND/NA	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; Buffer capacity
			Clinical examination, Bite-wing radiographs	enamel lesions were excluded	ND/NA	_	
				from DMFS scores	ND/NA	-	
				Cavitated lesion			
Najera et al.	1997	Permanent	DMFS	ND/NA	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva (for	General protective; Flow rate; pH
			Clinical examination; Radiographic examination	ND/NA	ND/NA	pH measurement);	
			radiographic Stanmaton	Cavitated lesion	ND/NA	Gustatory- stimulated parotid saliva (for flow rate measurement)	
Närhi et al.	1996	Permanent	DFS (crown); DFS (root) using DePaola et al. criteria (1989)	Crown; Root	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva;	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
			and Root Caries Index (RCI; Katz, 1980)	Incipient lesions and secondary	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	
			Clinical examination	caries were also recorded	ND/NA	saliva	
				Cavitated lesion; Demineralization			
Närhi et al.	1999	Permanent	DFS (crown); DFS (root) using DePaola et al. criteria (1989)	Crown; Root	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
			and Root Caries Index (RCI; Katz, 1980)	Incipient lesions and secondary	ND/NA	saliva	
			Clinical examination	caries were also recorded	ND/NA	-	
				Cavitated lesion; Demineralization			

Näsman et al.	1994	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DFS; DS; CI (initial caries); dfs, ds, ci; Proximal caries measured by bite-wing radiographs; DFS/dfs using Koch criteria (1967) Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs	ND/NA Proximal caries was recorded when radiolucency penetrated into dentin; initial caries was defined as a radiolucency limited to enamel Cavitated lesion; Demineralization	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
Naspitz et al.	1999	Primary	dmfs Clinical examinations	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva for immunologic analysis; Masticatory-stimulated whole saliva for microbial analysis	General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of anti-S. mutans IgA, IgM, and IgG; Total salivary levels of sIgA
O'Sullivan and Curzon	2000	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DFS, dfs Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity, pH
Öhrn et al.	1999	Permanent	DMFS; DFS; DS; WHO criteria (1987) Clinical examination, Radiographic examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity; pH
Pajari	1988	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFT; DMFS; dmft; dmfs; WHO criteria (1977) Clinical examination; Radiographic examination	Definite cavity extending into the dentin or secondary decay Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; Antimicrobial; Flow rate; pH; Levels of lysozyme and total IgA, IgG and IgM

Pandey et al.	1990	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFS; dfs: WHO criteria (1971) Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva (however, subjects used wax without chewing it)	General protective; Phosphorus concentration; Alkaline phosphatase activity
Parkash et al.	1994	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	ND/NA Clinical examination	Enamel and dentin Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of total and anti-S. mutans IgA, IgG and IgM
Pedersen et al.	1999	Permanent	DMFT, DMFS Clinical examinations	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Masticatory-stimulated whole saliva; Gustatory-stimulated parotid saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Levels of Na, K, statherin and total acidic prolinerich proteins (aPRPs)
Pienihäkkin en	1987	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFS; △DMFS; WHO criteria (1979); Incipient caries (INC) defined as a lesion without clinically detectable loss of substance: when INC was used as a predictor, the presence of ≥1 lesions on buccal or lingual tooth surfaces were regarded as a positive finding Clinical examination	ND/NA Incipient (INC) lesions on non- occlusal surfaces were recorded Cavitated lesion; Demineralizatio n	Salivary tests (salivary microbial counts and buffer capacity); INC lesions Buffer capacity pH ≤5.0 ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Buffer capacity
Pienihäkkin en et a.l	1987	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFS; ΔDMFS Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation; Salivary tests (buffer capacity) High risk=△DMFS>3, Buffer capacity pH ≤5.0 ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity

Pohjamo et al.	1988	Permanent	DS; FS; Intact surfaces (IS)	ND/NA	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
			Clinical examinations; Bite-wing radiographs	Only obvious lesions	ND/NA	saliva	
			33	extending into dentin were recorded	ND/NA		
				Cavitated lesion			
Raitio et al.	1996 a	Permanent	DFS; WHO criteria (1979); White spot lesions on buccal	Crown	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
			and lingual surfaces	Enamel, dentin	ND/NA	saliva	
			Clinical examination	Cavitated lesion	ND/NA		
Raitio et al.	1996 b	Mixed; Permanent	DFS, ADFS, DS, FS, WHO criteria (1987), White-spot	Crown	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate, Buffer capacity; Microbial nutrition activity
			lesions	Enamel lesions were excluded	ND/NA	saliva	(sucrase activity)
			Clinical examination	from DFS score	ND/NA		
	1000			Cavitated lesion	1000		
Ravald and List	1998	Permanent	DS (crown); FS (crown); FS (root); Active and inactive root	Crown; root	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva;	General protective; Flow rate
			caries (Nyvad and Fejerskov, 1982): Root caries index (RCI;	Approximal caries recorded	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	
			Katz, 1980)	only if radiographic	ND/NA	saliva	
			Clinical examination;	lesion			
			Radiographs when needed	penetrated >2/3 enamel; Active			
				root caries: soft			
				and yellowish or light brownish			
				color; Inactive			
				and brown to			
				black lesion color			
				Cavitated lesion			

Ravald et al.	1993	Permanent	Root caries according to Hix and O'Leary (1976) as modified according to Nyvad & Fejerskov (1986); DFS (root); DFS% (root, Ravald & Hamp criteria, 1981); Filled surfaces included both restorations confined to the root and coronal restoration extending onto the roof Clinical examination; Fullmouth radiographs	Root Active root caries defined as soft when probed; inactive root caries defined as hard when probed; Both active and inactive recorded regardless of involvement of adjacent enamel or existing restoration	ND/NA individuals were subgrouped based on DFS% ≤ 5 vs. > 5 during years 9-12 ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate, pH, Oral sugar clearance time
Riviere and Papagianno ulis	1987	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DFS Clinical examination; Radiographs	Cavitated lesion ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation Caries-free (CF) DFS=0; Caries-prone (CP) DFS _E 1 ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva ("not every child donated enough saliva to test every variable")	General protective, Antimicrobial; Levels of total IgA, IgG and IgM; Binding activity of IgA, IgG and IgM to various S. mutans serotypes
Rose et al.	1993	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFS Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation Caries risk defined as Caries susceptible (DMFS>5) and Caries resistant (DMFS≤ 1) ND/NA	Whole saliva (presumably unstimulated)	General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of anti-S. mutans IgA
Rose et al.	1994	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFS Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation Caries-resistant (CR) DMFS ≤1; Caries- susceptible (CS) DMFS > 5 ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Unstimulated parotid saliva	General protective, Antimicrobial; Levels of total and anti-S. mutans IgA, IgA1 and IgA2

Ruhl et al.	2000	ND/NA	ND/NA ND/NA	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; Protein concentrations; Electrophoretic pattern of protein and glycoprotein
Ryberg et al.	1987	Mixed, Permanent	DFS, FS, initial caries Clinical examination, 2 bitewing radiographs	ND/NA initial caries did not penetrate into dentin Cavitated lesion; Incipient lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva; Gustatory- stimulated parotid saliva	General protective; Flow rate, pH, buffer capacity, sodium, potassium, calcium, total protein, amylase, hexosamine, lysozyme, salivary peroxidase, bacteria-aggregating glycoproteins (BAGP), slgA
Ryberg et al.	1991	Mixed, Permanent	DFS, FS, initial caries Clinical examination, Bite-wing radiographs	ND/NA initial caries did not penetrate into dentin Cavitated lesion; Incipient lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva; Gustatory- stimulated parotid saliva	General protective; Flow rate, pH, buffer capacity, sodium, potassium, calcium, total protein, amylase, hexosamine, lysozyme, salivary peroxidase, bacteria-aggregating glycoproteins (BAGP), slgA
Rytömaa et al.	1998	Permanent	DMFS; WHO criteria (1987); both cavitation (DS) and pre- cavitation (DSini) were recorded for various coronal surfaces Clinical examination; Bitewing radiographs	ND/NA Cavitated lesion; Demineralization	ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; Stimulated whole saliva (presumably masticatory stimulated)	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
Seemann and Kage	1997	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFS; dmfs Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation Caries risk defined as Caries positive (DMFT≥4) and Caries negative (DMFT+dmft=0) ND/NA	ND/NA	General protective; Antimicrobial; Levels of total and anti-S. mutans IgA; Antiadhesive activity of salivary glyconjugates
Sepet et al.	1998	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFS; DMF; dfs; df; Performed Treatment Index (PTI); Required Treatment Index (RTI) Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; pH

Sgan- Cohen et al.	1992	Primary, Mixed, Permanent	DMFT, WHO criteria (1987) Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; pH, flow rate, bacterial counts
Shapira et al.	1991	Permanent	DMFS; DS; FS; WHO criteria (1977) Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; pH (using standard pH paper)
Siamopoulo u et al.	1989	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMF Index Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Gustatory- stimulated parotid saliva	General protective; Antimicrobial; Flow rate; Levels of calcium, phosphorous, potassium, chloride, sodium, urea, lysozyme, α-amylase and total lgA, lgG and lgM
Siamopoulo u-Mavridou et al.	1992	Mixed	DMFT; WHO criteria (1977) Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Gustatory- stimulated parotid saliva	General protective; Flow rate; functions of biochemical composition of saliva flow rate, the levels of Calcium, Inorganic phosphorus, Potassium, Sodium, Urea, Lysozyme, IgA; IgG; IgM
Söderholm and Birkhed	1988	Permanent	DMFS; ∆DFS Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs	Crown, root Primary and secondary caries were recorded; incipient caries were excluded Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate Buffer capacity
Soto-Rojas et al.	1998	Permanent	DS; WHO criteria (1987) Clinical examination	Occlusal; cervical ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	ND/NA	Self-reported oral dryness (visual analog scale, VAS 1-10)
Stabholz et al	1991	Mixed, Permanent	DMFS; DS; FS; WHO criteria (1977) Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; pH (using standard pH paper)

Stiefel et al.	1990	Permanent	DMFS; NIDCR criteria (1987)	ND/NA	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva; a subgroup of 22 chronic mental	General protective; Weight and volume of saliva collected
				ND/NA	ND/NA		(however, no data on weight or volume collected per minute raises questions for
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA	illness subjects (CMI) and 15 control subjects were used for duplicate collections on two separate days using both	comparing the two groups)
						expectoration and cotton-roll techniques	
Stiefel et al.	1993	Permanent	DMFS; NIDCR criteria (1987)	ND/NA	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; volume of saliva collected over 5 min
			Clinical examination	ND/NA	ND/NA		
				Cavitated lesion	ND/NA		
Sullivan	1990	Primary	dmfs using WHO criteria (1987); surface	ND/NA	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
			demineralization; approximal caries defined as radiolucent	ND//NA	ND/NA	saliva	
			areas that could not be related to normal anatomy or hypoplasia	Cavitated lesion; Demineralization	ND/NA		
			Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs				
Sullivan and Schröder	1989	Primary	dmfs using WHO criteria (1987); surface	ND/NA	ND/NA	Stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
Comodo			demineralization; approximal caries defined as radiolucent	ND//NA	ND/NA	A (presumably masticatory-stimulated); Buffer capacity data missing for	Capacity
			areas that could not be related \overline{C}	Cavitated lesion; Demineralization	ND/NA		
			Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs			one child age 5 y	
Sundh et al.	1993	Permanent	DMFT; DMFS; DS	ND/NA	ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva;	General protective; antimicrobial; Flow rate, total protein peroxidase,
			Clinical examination, Posterior bite-wing radiographs	Both incipient and microscopic	ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole	thiocyanate, slgA, lactoferrin, lysozyme and bacterial aggregation glycoprotein
				caries	ND/NA	saliva	(BAGP)
				Cavitated lesion			

Sundin et al.	1992	Permanent	Radiographic evaluation (posterior bite-wings)	ND/NA Caries was defined as radiolucent areas that could not be related to normal anatomy Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Oral sugar clearance time
Swanljung et al.	1992	Mixed; Permanent	DMFS; DMF; No. initial caries and white spot lesions; WHO criteria (1977) Clinical examination with fiber optic illumination; Bite-wing radiographs	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion; Demineralization	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; glucose concentration; buffer capacity; pH
Tenovuo et al	1986	Permanent	DMFS; DS; FS (surfaces that were both decayed and filled were counted as decayed surfaces) Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs; panoramic radiographs	only cavities extending to the dentin were recorded in DMFS index Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective Flow rate; glucose concentration; buffer capacity; pH;
Touyz et al.	1993	Permanent	DMFT Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Presumably masticatory- stimulated whole saliva (authors did not specify source)	General protective; Flow rate, pH
Tukia- Kulmala and Tenovuo	1993	Permanent	DMFS Clinical examination	ND/NA Only cavities extending into dentin were recorded Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
Twetman et al.	1989	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DFS of permanent teeth Clinical examination (data on caries experience obtained from dental cards)	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity; Total protein; Glucose concentration

VanWuyckh uyse et al.	1995	Permanent	DMFS Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Gustatory- stimulated parotid saliva	General protective; Concentrations of 20 free amino acids, in particular arginine and lysine
Vehkalahti et al.	1996	Permanent	DFMT (at baseline), ΔDFS; WHO criteria (1987) Clinical examination	ND/NA Lesions clearly reaching dentin were recorded as caries Cavitated lesion	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation; Salivary tests (buffer capacity, salivary microbial counts) High risk defined as ADFS>0; Flow rate of unstimulated saliva <0.2 ml/min, flow rate of stimulated whole saliva <1.0 ml/min; Buffering capacity final pH <4.5, MS score of 2 or 3 (£10 ⁵ CFU/ml) and LB score of 5 or 6 (£10 ⁵ CFU/ml)	Unstimulated whole saliva; Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity
Vranic et al.	1991	Permanent	ND/NA Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General protective; Concentrations of approx. 20 free amino acids
Wiktorsson et al.	1992	Permanent	Caries activity was registered clinically in three levels: Caries inactive, Caries active, High caries active Clinical examination	ND/NA into enamel and/or dentin; "active" or "arrested" Cavitated lesion	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation Caries-inactive (no active caries); Caries-active (both active and arrested caries); High caries-active (all carious lesions active); Active and High active groups were combined in the data analyses ND/NA	Stimulated whole saliva (no specific mention of whether masticatory or gustatory stimulation)	General protective; Flow rate; Buffer capacity

Wöltgens et al. Wöltgens et	1992 a	Primary; Mixed; Permanent	DMFS; White spot lesions described according to: none; initiation; regression; stabilization; and progression into a cavitated lesion Clinical examination DMFS; Interproximal	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion; Demineralization ; Remineralization Crown	Salivary test (Snyder test for lactobacilli – mediated acidogenic saliva) ND/NA ND/NA Salivary test (Snyder	Unstimulated whole saliva; Masticatory-stimulated whole saliva	General protection; Flow rate; Buffer capacity; pH; viscosity, Snyder test; concentrations of Mg, Ca and P General protection; Flow rate; Buffer
al.	b	Mixed; Permanent	radiographic lesions described according to: none; enamel outer half; enamel inner half; into dentin; and filling Clinical examination; Bite-wing radiographs	into enamel and/or dentin Cavitated lesion; Demineralization	test for lactobacilli – mediated acidogenic saliva) ND/NA ND/NA	whole saliva; Masticatory- stimulated whole saliva	capacity, pH; viscosity, Snyder test; Concentrations of Mg, Ca and P
Wood and Lee	1988	Permanent	DMFS; No. teeth with carious lesions Clinical examination; full mouth radiographs	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated whole saliva	General Protective; Visual grading: (1)= clinically dry (2)=not dry, but minimal (3)=normal (1)+(2)=xerostomia
Younger et al.	1998	Permanent	DMFS (crown); DS (root); FS (root); NIDCR criteria (1991) Clinical examination	Crown; Root ND/NA Cavitated lesion	ND/NA ND/NA ND/NA	Unstimulated parotid saliva; Unstimulated combined sublingual/subm andibular saliva; Gustatory-stimulated parotid saliva; Gustatory-stimulated combined sublingual/subm andibular saliva; Masticatory-stimulated whole saliva	General protective; Flow rate
Zimmer et al.	1997	Permanent	D _{3,4} MFS Clinical examination	ND/NA ND/NA Cavitated lesion	Clinical judgement based on dental evaluation High caries risk defined as D _{3,4} MFS >3 for 2-year caries increment ND/NA	ND/NA	General Protective; Buffer capacity